The Role of Aquitards in Groundwater Flow Systems

John Cherry

Director, University Consortium for Field Focused Groundwater Contamination Research Distinguished Emeritus Professor, Earth Sciences, University of Waterloo Adjunct Professor, School of Engineering, University of Guelph

FlowPATH – Hydrogeology Pathways University of Bologna, Bologna Italy June 21, 2012





Acknowledgements

- Beth Parker, main collaborator since 1991
- Bob Gillham and Garth Vander Kamp, during the 1970s and 1980s
- Bob Ingleton, field technician since 1980
- Barbara Lund, initiated first aquitard project, 1967
- **Atomic Energy Canada**
- Numerous other colleagues and grad students
- Major funding sources:
 - Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada
 - Many industrial site owners/sponsors



Origin of Terms - Latin

Aquifer: aqua = water, fer = to bear Aquitard: tard from tardus = to slow Aquiclude: clude from claudere = to shut Aquifuge: fuge = expel or drive away

Source: Todd, 1988

AQUITARD:

Used since late 1960's and now a common term in hydrogeology, except in the U.S. where 'confining bed' is preferred.



Groundwater flow lines and groundwater age in an aquifer-aquitard system



Groundwater Text Books Focus on Aquifers

Contain almost nothing about aquitards



Geotechnical Text Books





Emphasis on aquitards

with focus on:

- consolidation
- Strength
- permeability

 $K_v = 10^{-8} - 10^{-10} \text{ cm/s}$

Typical range of non indurated clayey aquitards



Geotechnical Tests to Determine K



 Consolidometer, oedometer and triaxial cell tests on cores

 $K_v = 10^{-8} - 10^{-10} \text{ cm/s}$

Typical range of non indurated clayey aquitards



My Aquitard Adventure Begins 1967



Whiteshell Nuclear Research Establishment Radioactive Waste Disposal Area



Waste Disposal



Waste Disposal in Clayey Aquitard Wastes deposited 1963-1999



Calculated Groundwater Velocity in Typical Unfractured, Non-Indurated Clayey Aquitard and is extremely small

Using K = 10⁻⁸ to 10⁻⁹ cm/sec and typical values for gradient and porosity

$$\overline{v} = \frac{K}{\phi} \frac{\Delta h}{\Delta L} = Millimeters per year$$

= Meters per Millennia



Rad-Waste in Weathered Fractured Zone



High water table in spring 1968 *Unanticipated*



Low water table in the summer



Test Pit Beside Disposal Area



Root Imprints on Fracture Surface



Natural Fractures





Contraction Fractures on a Modern Mud Plain



Simple Piezometer







Piezometer Cluster In Aquitard

Aquitard studies require profiles of:

- •Hydraulic head
- •Water isotopes
- Water chemistry

Piezometers to Understand Flow System

Schematic of Piezometer Cluster



Network of Conventional Piezometers



Pumping Test Schematic

Pump Aquifer and Monitor Aquitard



Pumping Test: Rapid response in some aquitard piezometers proves fully penetrating fractures





Active Groundwater Flow System



FLOW PATTERN

WNRE Radioactive Waste Case

The waste disposal facility was established in the early1960s without realistic hydrogeological concepts

Good site hydrogeology but bad engineering design because human control of leachate must continue for ~1000 years



Typical Winnipeg Landfill on Fractured Lake Agassiz Clay Aquitard

Is the gray clay an effective barrier even though it has vertical fractures?



Tritium (³H)

Radioactive isotope of hydrogen with a decay half-life of 12 years.

¹H is normal Hydrogen

²H is heavy hydrogen

³H is radioactive hydrogen





Tritium is a recent groundwater tracer



Since 1952, Tritium in rain is from atmospheric bomb tests



Base map: courtesy of the General Libraries. The University of





Weighted Mean δ¹⁸O‰ in Precipitation Winnipeg ≈ -14 ‰

Today's values represent conditions during the past 10,000 years

Since glaciers disappeared

~Holocene time



(Clark and Fritz, 1999)

How can these isotope profiles exist in an aquitard with fully penetrating fractures?





Puzzle Solved by diffusion

Introduces Fick's Law of diffusion to Hydrogeology

In summary, the diffusion process appears to have considerable capacity for reducing HTO concentrations in Chalk groundwater recharge.

The low level of thermonuclear tritium in groundwater from the suturated the Chalk aquifer, with alously low M the low level of unermonuclear unrule in ground water from size area has been recognized and the Chalk aquifer throughout much of its intake area has been recognized and the provide both the second size of the second size rome of the Grank aquiter throughout much of its meaner area reserved to the tritium inset as a major anomaly in British hydrogeology in recent years. The tritium profile of pore-water from the unsaturated zone at a Berkshire site in October BACKGROUND 1968 led Smith et al. (1970) to suggest that about 85% of the total flow of 1900 ieu omini et al. (1970) to suggest tinst about ouve or une roun now or vadose groundwater was by intergranular seepage at a mean rate of leas than 0.9 m/year, contradicting the widely-held concept that fissure-flow domi-No intyreat, contrauncing the without their concept that their any admitted in September 1970 from the in Decet (Benefit 1970). This work had serious implications for resources management and polluthis work not serious implications for resources management and point tion protection in this important aquifer, from which about 15% of all national water-supplies are derived. In the case of nitrate pollution resulting from 1970 for a site in Dorset (Smith, 1973). ar water-supplies are derived. In the case of intrace position reacting train stable farming for example, a critical question was the potentially high nitransfer targets to recomptly a critical question was the potentially right in-trate concentration of vadose pore-waters, by implication, in slow transit, through a thick provide the test to be related to be a set of the set of th the concentration of vacose pore-waters, by implication, in slow transit through a thick unsaturated zone to the water-table (Foster and Crease, 1974). The unquestionable advantages of tritium (HTO) as a tracer in studies of the unquestionable auvantages of unturn (TTO) as a tracer in studies of groundwater movement (e.g. Libby, 1961; Smith, 1973) give considerable to the intermetation but there are a studies of the statementation of the sta strength to the interpretation, but there are significant hydraulic objections. While the physical properties of Chalk are not such as to preclude significant while the physical properties of Unlike are not such as to precisive significant intergranular seepage in the unsaturated zone, in the absence of a major fisinvergrammar weepage in the unsaturated zone, in the absence of a major in-sure-flow component, it is difficult to see why surface run-off does not develop









Solute Retardation due to Matrix Diffusion

Diffusion drives molecules into the clay



Remenda et al, 1994

Isotope profiles where aquitard is so thick that no deep fractures found

Reprint Series 23 December 1994, Volume 266, pp. 1975–1978



Isotopic Composition of Old Ground Water from Lake Agassiz: Implications for Late Pleistocene Climate

V. H. Remenda,* J. A. Cherry, and T. W. D. Edwards



¹⁸O diffusion profiles in thickest Lake Agassiz clay indicate extremely cold paleo climate: $18O = -24^{\circ}/_{\circ\circ}$



Fig. 2. The δ⁷⁸O values (relative to VSMOW) of ground water sampled from monitoring wells at Montcalm, Drayton, and Manvel and from cores at Emerson.



J. A. Cherry R. W. Gillham University of Waterloo Waterloo, Ontario

1979

G. E. Grisak Alberta Environment Lethbridge, Alberta (Inland Waters Directorate Fisheries and Environment Canada Ottawa, Ontario)

> D. L. Lush Beak Consultants Limited Mississauga, Ontario

Earliest Proposal for Diffusion Controlled Radioactive Waste Disposal





Management Of Low-Level Radioactive Waste, Vol. 2, Editors, M. W. Carter, A. A. Moghissi, and B. Kahn, Pergamon Press, 1979.



Warman site near Saskatoon 1978: Proposed for uranium refinery waste disposal site in thick glacial till



Photographer uses the auger as an elevator


Shining borehole wall due to water seepage from fractures



Saturated clay but no flow

Fractured water inflow zone (<10m) sealed off using caisson allows deeper inspection

PREDICTABILITY OF SOLUTE TRANSPORT IN DIFFUSION-CONTROLLED HYDROGEOLOGIC REGIMES Robert W. Gillham and John A. Cherry Depratment of Earth Sciences University of Waterloo 1983 Waterloo, Ontario Proceeding of the Symposium on low level waste Disposal: Facility Design, Construction and Operating Practices. September 28-29, 1983 Washington D.C. Nuclear Regulatory Commission *"This paper presents arguments to show"* that in addition to having favorable velocity characteristics, transport in saturated,

diffusion-controlled hydrogeologic regimes is considerably more predictable than in the most common alternatives."



Clayey Aquitard Formed in Proglacial Lakes



Typical Municipal and Industrial Waste Disposal in Pits Before 1980s



Schematic View of Hydrochemical Conditions: Sarnia Clay Plain



¹⁸O Profiles fit diffusion models1-D Simulations of downward diffusion: Time is the fitting parameter

Diffusion dominated downward migration





Husain PhD Thesis, 1997

Upward Cl⁻ Diffusion Upward from Bedrock Begins



Negligible influence of advection

One of Canada's two main hazardous waste disposal sites 'uses' this aquitard

Industrial Waste Disposal Pit – 18m deep Receives waste from Canada and the US

New Landfill Design (1985): Waste Entombment Below the Water Table and Below the Weathered Zone



Buried Aquitard: No Fracture Scenario can Protect Lower Aquifer



No DNAPL entry to aquitar d

Buried Aquitard: Fractures Allow DNAPL to Pass Through Aquitard





Does DNAPL Move Through Small Fractures? Large Laboratory Column Experiment

Using the Danish technique developed by Peter Jorgensen 1991 - 1993

Suzanne K. O'Hara MSc. Thesis, University of Waterloo, June, 1997.

O'Hara, Parker, Cherry and Jørgensen (2000) Water Resources Research Vol. 36, No. I, pp 135-147

The Danish technique recreates in situ stress



DNAPL Entry Flow Experiment

Excavation to 3.5m to obtain column

Laidlaw Site Fracture Network





Obtain large sample with minimal disturbance

Hand-carved clay column









2. Flexible Polymer Membrane

3. Steel container to lab



First test: Water Flow

- Estimated fracture spacing = 23 cm
- Measured hydraulic gradients
- Measured Q = 1 ml/hr
- Calculated K_b
 - $K_{b} = 5.9 \times 10^{-8} \text{ cm/s} 1.1 \times 10^{-7}$ cm/s
- Calculated fracture aperture
 - = 4.6 μm 5.8 μm

based on the cubic law



Second Test: TCE DNAPL Flow



Identify DNAPL Pathways Using Diffusion Halos

Micro-coreholes from Sampling





Fracture aperture estimates: Extremely small fractures

- Fracture apertures very small: $K_b \cong K_m$
- Average hydraulic apertures (parallel plate)
 - Visible fractures $4.6 5.8 \ \mu m$
 - DNAPL identified channels 7.5 $12.5~\mu m$
- DNAPL entry pressure

– Corresponds to an aperture of $16.4-30~\mu m$

100 μ m is the average diameter of a human hair



Hydraulic test shows aquitard K < 10⁻⁸ cm/s

Aquitard and sheet piling prevent detectable water leakage

Cell Prepared For Release of PCE DNAPL at Borden Site, 1991

Cherry confident that aquitard will allow no DNAPL penetration



360



Augering Outside Cell

Red PCE DNAPL found on augers outside the cell

How could DNAPL escape the cell?

(photos by B.L. Parker)

Horizontal Microbeds

PCE in Thin Sand Bed



Dyed Red DNAPL in Sand Layer



DNAPL Escaped by Downward Flow in Small Fractures and Horizontal Flow in Microbeds





(W. Morrison MSc Thesis, 1998)

Essential data for aquitard study: Hydraulic Head Profiles



The Four Commercially Available Multidepth Systems for Head Profiles







Santa Fe





Waterloo Solinst Waterloo





Palo Alto



Borden Aquitard: Head Profile Shows Nearly all Resistance Occurs Across 2 ft Zone at Bottom of Aquitard



Borden Aquitard: This detailed vertical (**f**t) hydraulic head Jepth profile indicates a much higher K_v in the upper part of the aquitard infered low K zone Why?

Ground surface 0 **Hydraulic head March 1999** 10 Aquitard 20 30 40 700 710 feet (masl)

Vertical Fractures can be Inferred from Shape of Head Profile

Indicates a much higher K_v in the upper part of the aquitard

Because of lesser hydraulic gradient with depth







Petrochemical plants typically have abundant DNAPL in the subsurface

Example Petrochemical Plant in Lake Charles, Louisiana



Thick aquitard assumed to be DNAPL barrier



DNAPL passed through aquitard into regional sole source aquitard


Integrity of Louisiana Aquitards

Previous studies of clayey Louisiana aquitards at contaminated sites show poor integrity due to secondary permeability caused by fractures, root and worm holes

However, only Pleistocene aquitards have been investigated



Case study; Holocene Aquitard (2004-2011): Groundwater contamination beneath regional aquifer near Baton Rouge

Baton Rouge

New Orleans



Large Chemical Production Facility

Site

10 miles

Regional Surficial Geological Map, Site Location and Whiteman (1972) Cross-Section

Adapted from Louisiana Geological Survey Baton Rouge Geologic Map (2000)

Aquifer Contamination: Only cis-DCE and Vinyl Chloride Present All concentrations below 50 µg/L

Did the contamination pass through the aquitard?



Clayey aquitard ~ 100ft thick



Water Resources Bulletin No. 16, Department of Conservation Louisiana Geological Survey and Louisiana Dept. of Public Works, 1972

Detailed Piezometer Cluster in Uncontaminated Area to obtain profiles





Depth Elex. (ft.bgs) (ft.MSL) AQUITARD intal Distance Iff

Piezometer Array

Parker et al. unpublished data

Types of Piezometers Used in the Aquitard







Drive-Point Piezometer with Vibrating Wire Transducer (VWP)



Stable isotopes and chloride profiles show diffusion control suggesting excellent aquitard integrity



Contaminants did not go through the aquitard

Head profiles also show diffusion control suggesting excellent aquitard integrity



Bottom zone in aquitard is of lacustrine origin



Backswamp

deposits: higher vertical K due to fractures, rootholes animal burrows and weathering

Lacustrine deposits: No evidence of secondary permeability features and weathering



1927 Mississippi Flood Carries Large Load of Mud deposited widely



11,000 – 8,000 Years Ago (Holocene Time)

Larger Lakes Created by Frequent Flooding of Ancient Mississippi River



Key Points: Geology is most important

The aquitard has high integrity due to nature of both aquitard units:

- High DNAPL storage capacity by sandy layers and organic matter in fractured backswamp deposits prevents DNAPL from descending to top of lacustrine unit
- Deep lacustrine unit: diffusion controlled Contaminants have not moved through aquitard to aquifer

Viruses, Fractures and Aquitards

Viruses are colloid sized and have a life span less than ~2 years in the subsurface

Field experiment using solutes and colloids to demonstrate matrix diffusion



Looking downward at fracture network in tracer migration zone



Fracture Apertures 5 to 30 microns

Installing Seepage Collectors On Trench Walls Tracer trench being instrumented with vertical seepage meters on wall



Predicted Rapid Calculated Linear Groundwater Velocity in Horizontal Direction in Vertical Fractures

v = Darcy FluxBulk Effective Porosity Bulk K ~10⁻⁶ $\overline{v} = \frac{K_b}{\phi_f} \frac{\Delta h}{\Delta L} = A \text{ few meters / day}$ where ϕ_f = fracture porosity ~ 10⁻³ to 10⁻⁴ (calculated from the cubic law)

Diffusion Causes Strong Retardation of Bromide Arrival Relative to Calculated \overline{v}

BROMIDE ARRIVAL GRAPH





Colloids do not diffuse and therefore arrived much faster than bromide Virus-sized particles moved fast through very small fractures





Municipal Water Supply: Mt. Simon Aquifer, Beneath the Shale Aquitard



From Massie-Ferch 1997

Aquitard Thickness Indicated by Head Profile and Gamma Log



Human Viruses from Leaky Sewers Found in Municipal Wells Madison, WI, 2005

Human Enteric Viruses in Groundwater from a Confined Bedrock Aquifer

Mark A. Borchardt, Kenneth R. Bradbury, Madeline B. Gotkowitz, John A. Cherry, and Beth L. Parker *Environ. Sci. Technol.*, 2007, 41 (18), 6606-6612 • DOI: 10.1021/es071110+ Downloaded from http://pubs.acs.org on February 3, 2009



- ~ 220,000 people in Madison
- 30 million gallons of water pumped per day, primarily from Mt. Simon aquifer from 21 municipal wells
- Wells 5, 7, and 24 each pump between 1 and 2 million gallons per day

Lithologies Along Likely Virus Transport Path



Aquitard Travel Time: Flow in Fractures Through Aquitard

$$\overline{v} = \frac{K_{\text{bulk-vertical}}}{\phi_{\text{fracture}}} \frac{dh}{dl}$$

Flow in Idealized Parallel Plate Fractures

$$\overline{v} = \frac{(2x10^{-7} cm/s)(1.8)}{3x10^{-6}} = 104 \text{ m/d}$$

$$32 \ \mu\text{m fractures spaced 10 m apart}$$

$$t = \frac{\text{thickness (m)}}{\overline{v} (\text{m/d})} = \frac{9m}{104m/d} = 2.1 \text{ hours fractures spaced 10 m apart}$$





 Groundwater travel times in networks with even small fractures can be fast

 Virus research concerning groundwater is still in its infancy



Commercially Available Multilevel Systems











Depth Discrete Multilevel Monitoring



Multilevel System (MLS) A single device installed into a borehole that divides the hole into many separate intervals for depth-discrete monitoring



adapted from Cherry 2000

Problem Statement

- Midwestern communities commonly rely on groundwater from sedimentary rock aquifers
- Water quantity and quality issues are comingled
- Powerful numerical models are needed for decision-making

High resolution field data are essential



Site Located in South Central WI





Dane County, Wisconsin



Figure modified from Bradbury et al. (1999), WGNHS OFR 1999-04 based on information from Massie-Ferch et al. (1997), GSA Abstracts with Programs



Aquitards in Flow Systems





Schematic Head Profile



Inflections Are . . .



Discrete change in head with depth



Vertical Component of Hydraulic Gradient





Geologic Conceptual Model




Detailed Westbay Multilevel System

Multilevel System

✓ monitors 129.5 m of bedrock

✓46 monitoring zones

 ✓83% of monitoring zones are < 2.5 m long



Head Profile Characteristics



•Large vertical gradients at inflections

 Inflections do not always correlate with stratigraphy

360

Meyer et al., 2008, Envir. Geology, v. 56, p. 27-44

Head Profiles from Westbay Systems Used to Delineate Hydrogeologic Units

Meyer, Parker & Cherry, 2008 Environ. Geol., 2008, Vol. 56, No. 1, pp. 27-54

Environ Geol (2008) 56:27-44 DOI 10.1007/s00254-007-1137-4

ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Detailed hydraulic head profiles as essential data for defining hydrogeologic units in layered fractured sedimentary rock

Jessica R. Meyer · Beth L. Parker · John A. Cherry

Received: 15 September 2007/Accepted: 12 November 2007/Published online: 7 December 2007 © Springer-Verlag: 2007

Abstract This paper describes a study in southern Wisconsin where vertical hydraulic head profiles measured in exceptional detail provided the key data for defining hydrogeologic units (HGUs) in a layered sequence of sandstone, siltstone, shale, and dolostone. The most important data were obtained from corehole MP-6 which was cored 131 m into bedrock and instrumented using a Westbay¹⁰ multilevel system with 36 depth discrete monitoring intervals. The resulting head profile is consistant over time and shows eight distinct inflections in hydraulac head. Several of the inflections occur between adjacent permeable units and are likely due to poor vertical connectivity of fracture sets rather than distinct lower permeability layers or aquitards in the conventional sense.

Introduction

In the 1960s, the focus of groundwater research turned to analysis and modeling of regional scale flow systems (Toth 1962, 1963; Freeze and Witherspoon 1966, 1967). For example. Foth (1963) demonstrated the influence of topography on flow paths which led to the definition of regional, intermediate, and local groundwater flow systems. Toth's (1953) research was expanded on by Freeze and Witherspoon (1966) who introduced a numerical model to investigate idealized regional groundwater flow patterns. Later, Freeze and Witherspoon (1967) showed vertical 2D cross-sections from numerical simulations where lines of equal head are refracted at the interfaces





Example Inflection – No Shale Bed



Defining HGUs Using Head Profiles



•Head profiles indicate 11 HGUs

HGUs don't correlate with stratigraphy





13 Bedrock Westbay Systems Total of 265 Monitoring Intervals



Head Inflections Correlate



•Smooth geometrical head profiles

 Inflections correlate across the site



Vertical Gradients Correlate Across Site



Vertical gradients indicate position in flow system



Defining the 3D Hydrogeologic Framework



4 km (vertical exaggeration ~ 31 x)

- HGUs are generally laterally extensive
- St. Peter formation unconformity disrupts the HGUs



Comprehensive Definition of <u>13</u> Bedrock HGUs



Schematic Flow System







Key Findings

- Detailed hydraulic head profiles are essential evidence for defining hydrogeologic units in fractured sedimentary rock
- Conventional approach using stratigraphic units to define hydrogeologic units is invalid



Summary of Aquitard Literature – AWWARF (2006)

1.

2.



Cherry, J.A., B.L. Parker, K.R. Bradbury, T.T. Eaton, M.G. Gotkowitz, D.J. Hart and M.A. Borchardt, 2005. Contaminant Transport Through Aquitards: A "State of the Science" Review. AWWA Research Foundation, Denver, Colorado.

K.R. Bradbury, M.G. Gotkowitz, D.J. Hart, T.T. Eaton, Cherry, J.A., B.L. Parker, and M.A. Borchardt, 2005. Contaminant Transport Through Aquitards: Technical Guidance for Aquitard Assessment. AWWA Research Foundation, Denver, Colorado.



Summary

- Aquitards generally govern aquifer-aquitard systems
- Aquitard studies typically need profiles of:
 - Hydraulic Head
 - Water Isotopes
 - Major Ions
- Aquitards commonly show evidence of paleohydrology
- Fractures must be assumed to be present until sufficient evidence is gathered to show otherwise



Thank you for your attention.

Questions? Comments?